Tracking the Canadian Economy through COVID-19: Insights from customer transactions – September 10, 2020

Nikita Perevalov* (Scotiabank Economics)
Taha Jaffer, Jason Liang (Data Science and Analytics)
Roland Merbis, Artur Motruk (Customer Insights & Analytics)

* Director of Economic Forecasting, 437.775.5137, nikita.perevalov@scotiabank.com
Overview

1. Key Insights from Customer Transactions
2. COVID-19, the Canadian Economy and Scotiabank’s Transactions Data
3. Business Transactions Data Details
4. Retail Transactions Data Details
5. Other High-Frequency Indicators of Activity
1. Key Insights from Canadian Customer Transactions

This presentation is part of the weekly series intended to draw insights about the state of the Canadian economy from the flow of Scotiabank’s retail and non-retail transactions data.

Key takeaways from the payments data in this week’s publication:

• Updated to September 4\textsuperscript{th}, automated funds transfers in the business sector remained volatile:
  o Incoming transactions declined in late August, before rebounding in the first few days of September. While some of this dynamic is explained by transactions in the financial sector, most industries saw declines in late-August. In particular, payments to manufacturing firms failed to surpass the level of 2019, having come close in mid-August, before falling back more recently.
  o Payroll deposits, while volatile, have stabilized relative to 2019 levels, suggesting that the pace of job growth has likely slowed in August.

• Consumer transactions, available through September 6\textsuperscript{th}, have remained relatively stable compared to last year’s levels:
  o Credit card spending, as well as cash usage, as shown by low levels of ABM transactions, continue to lag significantly compared to debit card usage.
  o Levels of spending in most categories have now stabilized compared to 2019. Nevertheless, there are tentative signs of spending starting to slow relative to July-August.
  o Recently-observed creep up in the number of COVID-19 cases across Canada could constrain and even reverse the nascent recovery in the hard-hit retail sectors.
2. COVID-19 and the Canadian Economy: Scotiabank Transactions Data

- We present data on retail and non-retail transactions, which capture distinct but related aspects of economic activity in Canada.

- The data comprises actual observed daily transactions going through debit or credit card payment networks in the retail space, and automated funds transfers (AFTs) in the non-retail space.
  - The transactions are anonymized and aggregated to protect the privacy of Scotiabank’s clients.

- In the current circumstances, comparing the dollar volumes of transactions in the current year and in 2019 can be indicative of the depth of the decline in economic activity in Q2-2020 and help track growth through the re-opening phase.
  - Note that the mapping from the volume of transactions to measures of economic activity (e.g. GDP) is imperfect, and so care must be taken when drawing the implications.

- The AFT payments show bill payments to/from companies in Canada.
  - Incoming payments can be associated with company revenue, and outgoing payments can be associated with costs.

- Debit and credit card payments can be used to measure the evolution of retail spending at various types of establishments.
  - The transactions can serve as a measure of economy-wide retail spending, and of the extent to which households are resuming pre-COVID levels of activity.
  - Note that the use of electronic payments has increased because of COVID-19, so comparisons to year-ago levels can be misleading. These data are best used to observe directional movements rather than to make specific assessments on the level of activity.
2. COVID-19 and the Canadian Economy: Caveats

There are important caveats to analysis based on the payments data:

• The data is observed at daily frequency and embeds different types of seasonal patterns.
  o For retail payments, the volume and types of payments are different depending on the day of the week and the season.
  o For non-retail payments, both the day of the week and the season are important. In addition, some payments are tied to the calendar date (e.g. rent payments are made on the first day of each month), some payments have a bi-weekly schedule, etc.
  o To smooth out most of the day-to-day seasonality we use a 14-day moving average of the dollar volume of transactions, taking a y/y% change to remove any remaining seasonal patterns related to the calendar date.

• In addition to seasonality, there is normal payment volatility related to the random nature of the transactions process and the impact of regional and economy-wide events (weather, labour strikes, etc.).
  o The volatility of this nature may or may not be related to economic activity as measured by GDP and so, as mentioned above, care must be taken in drawing inference.

• For business transactions, which are inherently more lumpy compared to retail spending, data towards the end of the sample can be revised as some AFT payments are recorded with a lag. As a result we exclude the last few days of data of business transactions only.
3. Business Transactions Data: Volatile Hand-off to September

- Automated Funds Transfers (AFT) are used for:
  - rent and mortgage payments;
  - payroll deposits; and
  - other bills.

- Incoming transactions declined in late August, before rebounding in the first few days of September. While some of this dynamic is explained by transactions in the financial sector, most industries saw declines in late-August.

- In particular, payments to manufacturing firms failed to surpass the level of 2019, having come close in mid-August, before falling back more recently (charts 2-6).

- Payments in transportation and warehousing industries continue to run far below last year’s levels.

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Data Science and Analytics.

Chart 2

14-day ma of daily dollar volume of transactions, incoming AFT payments, y/y %
Wholesale trade, 5.3% of GDP

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Data Science and Analytics.

Chart 3

14-day ma of daily dollar volume of transactions, incoming AFT payments, y/y %
Retail trade, 5.7% of GDP

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Data Science and Analytics.

Chart 4

14-day ma of daily dollar volume of transactions, incoming AFT payments, y/y %

All industries

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Data Science and Analytics.

Transportation & warehousing, 3.6% of GDP

Chart 5

14-day ma of daily dollar volume of transactions, incoming AFT payments, y/y %

All industries

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Data Science and Analytics.

Manufacturing, 9.6% of GDP

Chart 6

14-day ma of daily dollar volume of transactions, incoming AFT payments, y/y %

All industries

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Data Science and Analytics.

Finance and insurance, 7.5% of GDP

All industries
3. Business Transactions Data: Bill Payments Remain High in early September

- Outgoing AFT payments remained at elevated levels in early September (Chart 7):
  - Payroll deposits, while volatile, have stabilized relative to 2019 levels, suggesting that the pace of job growth has likely slowed in August. (Charts 8 and 9).

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Data Science and Analytics.
3. Business Transactions Data: Rent/Payroll Payments Stabilize

**Chart 8**

**Rent Payments**

- Dollar volume, cumulative daily total for each month, y/y %
- Physical distancing measures began to be implemented in mid-March
- September 1, 2020 fell on a Tuesday in 2020, but on a Sunday in 2019.

**Sources:** Scotiabank Economics, Data Science and Analytics.

**Chart 9**

**Payroll Deposits**

- 28-day ma of daily dollar volume of transactions, y/y %
- Physical distancing measures began to be implemented in mid-March

**Sources:** Scotiabank Economics, Data Science and Analytics.
4. Retail Transactions Data: Card Spending Growth Stabilized

- Consumer transactions, available through September 6th have remained relatively stable compared to last year’s levels (chart 10):
  - Most categories of merchants now see spending flattening relative to a year ago.
  - Credit card spending, as well as cash usage, as shown by low levels of ABM transactions, continue to lag significantly compared to debit card usage.

- The amounts of CERB payments have been gradually coming down since reaching a peak in mid-April, in line with the observed improvement in the labour market in May-July.

Chart 10

Credit and Debit Card Transactions

14-day ma of daily dollar volume of transactions, contribution to y/y %

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Customer Insights, Data & Analytics.
4. Retail Transactions Data: Use of Bank Machines Down

- A measure of declining cash usage, the volume of transactions through automatic banking machines (ABMs) has remained significantly below the level of 2019 with no sign of a turnaround (Chart 11):
  - A jump in ABM transactions in mid-March, as demand for cash skyrocketed amid economic uncertainty, gave rise to a deep contraction in April.
  - The volume of ABM transactions stagnated far below the level of 2019 for most of the summer.
  - The declining use of cash as well as more people working from home is likely the explanation for the lack of recovery in ABM use.
4. Retail Transactions Data: Provinces See Volatile Pattern of Spending in September

- Province-level data shows a consistent trend across provinces.

- Y/Y transactions growth in Ontario has turned lower in late-August and early September, despite a gradually expanding share of the re-opened economy (Chart 12). Most provinces show a decline since mid-August and the recent pickup in the number of COVID-19 cases could slow the recovery further.

- Note that the share of card transactions not tied to a particular province has been on the rise recently, explaining some of the divergence between the Canada-wide trend and provincial totals.
4. Retail Transactions Data: Card Spending Across Most Categories Stabilizes

- Throughout the past few months the dynamics and the composition of spending have remained relatively stable (Chart 16):
  - Spending on groceries, hardware and computers explains most of the y/y growth, while being partly offset by still-weak travel-related spending.

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Customer Insights, Data & Analytics.
4. Retail Transactions Data: Travel, Restaurants and Entertainment Spending Stalled

- As August came to an end most merchants had seen card spending stabilize relative to last year’s levels, e (Chart 17):
  - Going forward, the continued recovery in the hard-hit areas of the retail sector will depend on the evolution of COVID cases and the successful re-opening of schools across Canada.
  - Recently-observed creep up in the number of cases could constrain and even reverse the nascent recovery.

![Chart 17](chart.png)

14-day ma of daily dollar volume of transactions, y/y %

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Customer Insights, Data & Analytics.
4. Retail Transactions Data: Growth in Digital Spending Trending Down

- Categories that have been outperforming since the start of the pandemic still show strong, albeit declining, growth relative to last year (Chart 18).

Chart 18

14-day ma of daily dollar volume of transactions, y/y %

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Customer Insights, Data & Analytics.
5. Other High-Frequency Indicators Of Activity

Charts 19-32 Google Searches, Various Keywords, Dining and Transportation Data

- Google Searches for “Quarantine”
- Google Searches for “Reopening”
- Google Searches for “Wage Subsidy”
- Google Searches for “Commercial Rent”
- Google Searches for “Employment Insurance”
- Google Searches for “CERB”

Method of Transportation in Ottawa

Method of Transportation in Halifax

Method of Transportation in Montreal

Method of Transportation in Toronto

Method of Transportation in Calgary

Method of Transportation in Vancouver

OpenTable Reservations in Canada

Google Mobility Trends in Canada

Sources: Scotiabank Economics, Google Trends.
Opinions, estimates and projections contained herein are our own as of the date hereof and are subject to change without notice. The information and opinions contained herein have been compiled or arrived at from sources believed reliable but no representation or warranty, express or implied, is made as to their accuracy or completeness. Neither Scotiabank nor any of its officers, directors, partners, employees or affiliates accepts any liability whatsoever for any direct or consequential loss arising from any use of this report or its contents. These reports are provided to you for informational purposes only. This report is not, and is not constructed as, an offer to sell or solicitation of any offer to buy any financial instrument, nor shall this report be construed as an opinion as to whether you should enter into any swap or trading strategy involving a swap or any other transaction. Neither Scotiabank nor any of its officers, directors, partners, employees or affiliates accepts any liability whatsoever for any direct or consequential loss arising from any use of this report or its contents. The information and opinions contained herein have been compiled or arrived at from sources believed reliable but no representation or warranty, express or implied, is made as to their accuracy or completeness. Neither Scotiabank nor any of its officers, directors, partners, employees or affiliates accepts any liability whatsoever for any direct or consequential loss arising from any use of this report or its contents.

For each type of transaction (retail and ATF), we calculated a 14-day moving average of daily transactions for 2020 and 2019. We compared the series to 100 at the maximum weekly total. For both years, we used a corresponding average for the same month and day. We analyzed anonymized automated funds transfers (ATFs) by businesses through the Automated Clearing Settlement System where they operate, including, Scotiabanc Inc.; Citadel Hill Advisors L.L.C.; The Bank of Nova Scotia Trust Company of New York; Scotiabank Europe plc; Scotiabank (Ireland) Limited; Scotiabank Inverlat S.A., Institución de Banca Múltiple, Scotiabank Inverlat Casa de Bolsa S.A. de C.V., Scotia Inverlat Derivados S.A. de C.V. – all members of the Scotiabank group and authorized users of the Scotiabank mark. The Bank of Nova Scotia is incorporated in Canada with limited liability and is authorized and regulated by the Office of the Superintendent of Financial Institutions Canada. The Bank of Nova Scotia is authorized by the UK Prudential Regulation Authority and is subject to regulation by the UK Financial Conduct Authority and limited regulation by the UK Prudential Regulation Authority. Details about the extent of The Bank of Nova Scotia’s regulation by the UK Prudential Regulation Authority are available from us on request. Scotiabank Europe plc is authorized by the UK Prudential Regulation Authority and regulated by the UK Financial Conduct Authority and the UK Prudential Regulation Authority. Scotiabank Inverlat, S.A., Scotia Inverlat Casa de Bolsa, S.A. de C.V., and Scotia Derivados, S.A. de C.V., are each authorized and regulated by the Mexican financial authorities. Not all products and services are offered in all jurisdictions. Services described are available in jurisdictions where permitted by law.

Scotiabank recognizes the importance of personal and business information and we never take for granted the trust that you have placed in us to protect that information. We are committed to the ethical use of all our data. This report is based on anonymized and aggregated information and cannot be linked to any identifiable individual or business. For additional details on how we protect personal information, see https://www.scotiabank.com/privacy.

We analyzed anonymized automated funds transfers (ATFs) by businesses through the Automated Clearing Settlement System where Scotiabank is one of the parties. The analysis was based on 22 Transaction Codes (see Payments Canada for more information on transaction types) across 20 industries. We also analyzed anonymized retail transactions (debit and credit card payments) through Scotiabank, with 18 broad spending categories based on 264 merchant types. Finally, we used aggregated totals for deposits related to the Canada Emergency Response Benefit made into customer accounts in chart 12. Indexing the series to 100 at the maximum weekly total.

For each type of transaction (retail and ATF), we calculated a 14-day moving average daily in 2020 through early May and compared to a corresponding average for the same month and day in 2019.